

The Construction of Evaluation Indicators for Ideological and Political Education in Higher Vocational Courses Based on the Kirkpatrick Model and CIPP Evaluation

Xiaoyan Liu, Lingling Wang

Weihai Ocean Vocational College, Rongcheng 264300, China

Abstract

Establishing a scientific and reasonable evaluation index system for ideological and political education in courses is not only a key link in implementing the fundamental task of fostering virtue and nurturing talent, but also an important guarantee for improving the evaluation mechanism of education, deepening educational and teaching reforms, and enhancing the quality of talent cultivation. This paper refines the evaluation indicators through literature analysis and qualitative interviews with teachers, students, and enterprises, and constructs an evaluation index system for ideological and political education in higher vocational courses based on the Kirkpatrick model and the CIPP evaluation model. It aims to provide structural support for the evaluation system of ideological and political education in courses, ensuring that evaluation activities are based on evidence and measurable.

Keywords

Ideological and political Education in Curriculum; Kirkpatrick Model; CIPP; Evaluation indicators.

1. Introduction

Course-based ideological and political education is a new achievement in the development of the theory of socialist education with Chinese characteristics in the new era. Research on the concepts, content design, and teaching models of course-based ideological and political education has become increasingly clear, while research on the evaluation theories and methods of course-based ideological and political education is relatively lacking. The evaluation of ideological and political education in courses is a crucial link in the formation of a closed loop of the ideological and political education teaching system in courses. It can help teachers effectively improve their teaching strategies and plays an important role in promoting the construction of ideological and political education in courses. In May 2020, the Ministry of Education issued the "Guiding Outline for the Construction of Ideological and Political Education in College Courses", explicitly requiring the establishment of a multi-dimensional assessment and evaluation system and supervision mechanism for the effectiveness of ideological and political education in college courses. In October of the same year, the Central Committee of the Communist Party of China and the State Council issued the "Overall Plan for Deepening the Reform of Education Evaluation in the New Era", stating that education evaluation should "improve result evaluation, strengthen process evaluation, explore value-added evaluation, and improve comprehensive evaluation". The successive release of these documents highlights the urgency of constructing an evaluation system for ideological and political education in college courses and also points out the direction for its construction.

The evaluation indicators of ideological and political education in courses serve as the logical starting point and practical basis for constructing the corresponding evaluation system. Their scientificity and systematicness directly determine the reliability and validity of the evaluation

work. The core value of the evaluation indicators lies in their ability to transform the abstract high-level goal of "educational effectiveness" into observable and measurable specific dimensions, such as the appropriateness of teaching objectives, the integration of ideological and political elements with professional content, and students' cognitive and emotional gains. Through this transformation, the evaluation indicators provide a clear logical framework and structural support for the evaluation system, guiding the evaluation activities from vague empirical judgments to precise scientific measurements. Further, the evaluation indicators not only fundamentally define the core issues of "what to evaluate" and "how to evaluate" in the evaluation system, but also, at a deeper level, steer the evolution direction of ideological and political education in courses.

In terms of the evaluation of ideological and political education in courses, Wang Mengmeng et al.[1] adopted the Kirkpatrick model to assess the implementation effect of ideological and political education in courses, while Bao Juan[2], Gu Jia et al.[3] used the CIPP model to evaluate the ideological and political education teaching in international economics and trade and nursing courses. The Kirkpatrick model mainly assesses the effect after learning, and the evaluation results can only be used for the next learning. The CIPP model precisely makes up for the deficiency of the Kirkpatrick model, extending the learning assessment to before and during the learning process. However, its drawback lies in the lack of detailed research on the assessment dimension of the highest-level result layer, which the Kirkpatrick model can make up for. In view of this, this paper combines the Kirkpatrick model and the CIPP model, and refines the evaluation indicators from two aspects: literature analysis and qualitative interviews, to construct the evaluation indicators of ideological and political education in courses, with the aim of providing a basis for teaching diagnosis and teaching reform.

2. Evaluation Model Theory

2.1. CIPP Evaluation Model

The CIPP evaluation model, an evaluation approach centered on decision optimization and continuous improvement, was initially conceived by the renowned American evaluation expert Stufflebeam in the 1960s and was systematically established and refined in the early 1970s. The CIPP evaluation model encompasses four evaluation activities: context evaluation, input evaluation, process evaluation, and outcome evaluation [4-5].

Background evaluation, as the starting point of evaluation, deeply analyzes the macro and micro environments of education, aiming to clearly define and clarify the actual needs of educational activities. This process not only examines the potential impact of the external environment on educational activities but also ensures that educational goals are closely aligned with actual needs, laying a solid foundation for subsequent evaluation work.

Input evaluation focuses on the rational allocation of resources and the sufficiency of conditions. By conducting a detailed assessment of the various resources (such as funds, teaching staff, facilities, etc.) and conditions required to achieve the set goals, it ensures the feasibility and effectiveness of the educational implementation plan. This process emphasizes the optimal allocation of resources, aiming to provide a strong guarantee for the smooth progress of educational activities through reasonable investment.

Process evaluation shifts its focus to the specific implementation process of educational activities, emphasizing the performance and interaction of both teachers and students. It not only examines whether teachers conduct teaching in accordance with the pre-determined plan but also stresses whether teachers continuously supervise, inspect and provide feedback during the implementation process, and whether they promptly revise and improve the plan based on the feedback results. This process reflects the dynamic and flexible nature of

educational activities, ensuring that they can constantly adapt to changes in actual situations and achieve the best educational outcomes.

Outcome evaluation, as the endpoint and summary of the evaluation system, comprehensively examines the implementation results and impacts of educational activities. By comparing and analyzing the differences between expected goals and actual outcomes, outcome evaluation not only accurately assesses the effectiveness and value of educational activities but also provides valuable experience and lessons for future educational activities. This process emphasizes the feedback role of evaluation results, aiming to provide scientific basis and reference for future educational decisions through summarizing past experiences and deficiencies.

2.2. Kirkpatrick's Evaluation Model

The Kirkpatrick Model, also known as the Kirkpatrick Hierarchy Model, was pioneeringly proposed by Professor Donald L. Kirkpatrick of the University of Wisconsin in 1959. It mainly includes four aspects of evaluation activities: the reaction level, the learning level, the behavior level, and the effect level. This model is one of the earliest assessment tools to be introduced and widely adopted globally, with far-reaching influence and extensive application[6].

The reaction level mainly focuses on the immediate responses and satisfaction of the learners towards the educational activities. By collecting feedback from the learners through methods such as questionnaires, group discussions or face-to-face interviews, one can understand their overall feelings about the educational activities, as well as their satisfaction with the teaching content, teaching methods and educators. This level of assessment helps to identify the strengths and weaknesses in the educational process and provides a basis for subsequent improvements.

The learning level focuses on evaluating the mastery of knowledge and skills by the educated after educational activities. Through assessment methods such as examinations, tests, project assignments, practical exercises or ability demonstrations, the learning outcomes of learners can be quantitatively measured to confirm whether they have achieved the predetermined learning goals. This level of assessment is a key link in testing the effectiveness of education and an important indicator for measuring the quality of education.

The behavioral level mainly focuses on the behavioral performance of the educated after the educational activities, and whether they can effectively apply the knowledge and skills they have learned to their daily work and life. Through methods such as observation, peer evaluation, feedback from superiors, self-assessment or performance indicators, the changes and growth of learners at the behavioral level can be evaluated. The assessment at this level helps to confirm whether the educational activities have truly promoted the behavioral transformation of learners and laid a foundation for their career development.

The outcome level, as the highest level of evaluation, focuses on the long-term benefits and achievements that educational activities bring to the educated, which include but are not limited to increased income, improved social status, and enhanced innovation capabilities resulting from career growth, personal development, and skill improvement. Through long-term tracking surveys, comparative analyses, or case studies, the profound impact of educational activities on the personal development and social contributions of the educated can be assessed. This level of evaluation serves as an important yardstick for testing the value of educational activities and is also a crucial basis for educational investment decisions.

The CIPP evaluation model takes the entire process of educational activities as the evaluation object and focuses on the continuous improvement of teaching quality. In contrast, the Kirkpatrick model mainly assesses the effect after learning, and the evaluation results can only be applied to the next learning. The CIPP model precisely makes up for the deficiency of the Kirkpatrick model by extending the learning assessment to the period before learning and during the learning process. However, its drawback lies in the lack of detailed research on the

assessment dimension of the highest-level result layer. The Kirkpatrick model can precisely make up for this deficiency. Therefore, the reaction layer, learning layer, behavior layer, and result layer of the Kirkpatrick model are integrated into the result evaluation of the CIPP model.

3. The Process of Constructing Evaluation Indicators

3.1. Extract Evaluation Indicators through Literature Analysis

The current research literature on the evaluation of ideological and political education in courses mainly focuses on two dimensions: one is the construction of an evaluation system for the implementation effect of ideological and political education in courses under the higher vocational education system; the other is the exploration of the effectiveness of integrating ideological and political education into a specific major or a single course. The evaluation indicators of the literature closely related to the research topic are summarized in Table 1.

Table 1. A Review of the Evaluation Indicators of the Literature Closely Related to This Subject (1)

Numble	Literature	Evaluation Indicator
1	Research on the construction of the evaluation index system for ideological and political teaching in college and university curriculum [7]	<p>A1 Teaching attitude: B1 Rigorous in scholarship; B2 Strict in requirements; B3 Fully engaged in teaching; B4 Diligent and responsible.</p> <p>A2 Teaching objectives: B5 In line with the teaching syllabus; B6 Diversified objectives; B7 Clear objectives.</p> <p>A3 Teaching content: B8 Education on thought of socialism with Chinese characteristics for a new era; B9 Core values education; B10 Learning ethics education; B11 Professional ethics education; B12 Constitution and rule of law education; B13 Education on fine traditional Chinese culture and the "the histories of the Party, New China, the reform and opening-up, and socialist development".</p> <p>A4 Teaching methods: B14 Lecture-based teaching; B15 Heuristic teaching; B16 Seminar-based teaching; B17 Problem-driven teaching; B18 Case-based teaching.</p> <p>A5 Teaching effect: B19 Humanistic quality; B20 Scientific attitude; B21 Social responsibility; B22 Environmental ethics and morality; B23 Global awareness.</p>
2	Research on curriculum ideological and political evaluation system of higher vocational colleges based on CIPP evaluation [8]	<p>A1 Preset goals: B1 Basic positioning of the course; B2 Ideological and political goals of the course.</p> <p>A2 Implementation foundation: B3 Ideological and political resources of the course; B4 Ideological and political plan of the course.</p> <p>A3 Execution process: B5 Teaching subject; B6 Teaching process; B7 Teaching field.</p> <p>A4 Construction outcomes: B8 Development of students' ideological and political quality; B9 Development of teachers' ideological and political competence; B10 Social impact.</p>
3	On the construction of the evaluation system for ideological and political education in college courses [9]	<p>A1 Organization management: B1 Leadership responsibility; B2 Work mechanism; B3 Guarantee measures.</p> <p>A2 Professional construction: B4 Talent cultivation; B5 Scientific research; B6 Social service.</p> <p>A3 Curriculum teaching: B7 Teaching implementation; B8 Teaching reform; B9 Teaching evaluation.</p> <p>A4 Team building: B10 Teacher training; B11 Integrated development; B12 Capacity enhancement.</p> <p>A5 Team building: B13 Learning process; B14 Learning outcomes; B15 Practical performance.</p>

Table 1. A Review of the Evaluation Indicators of the Literature Closely Related to This Subject (2)

Numble	Literature	Evaluation Indicator
4	Research on the construction of evaluation index system of ideological and political teaching in all colleges course [10]	<p>A1 Teaching content: B1 Laws and regulations; B2 Core socialist values; B3 Domestic and international current affairs; B4 Professional ethics; B5 Basic national conditions and major policies; B6 Party and national history; B7 Excellent traditional Chinese culture.</p> <p>A2 Teaching methods: B8 Case analysis; B9 Visual demonstration; B10 Situational teaching; B11 Classroom discussion; B12 Lecture.</p> <p>A3 Teaching outcomes: B13 Social responsibility; B14 Cultural literacy; B15 Global awareness; B16 Learning attitude; B17 Critical thinking; B18 National responsibility; B19 Honesty and trustworthiness; B20 Thrift and frugality; B21 Compliance with laws and regulations.</p>
5	Construction of the evaluation index system of all-course-based ideological and political education in higher education courses [11]	<p>A1 Learning content: B1 Historical and cultural knowledge; B2 Professional development; B3 Values and beliefs.</p> <p>A2 Learning process: B4 Thinking patterns; B5 Professional skills; B6 Degree of engagement.</p> <p>A3 Learning outcomes: B7 Value guidance; B8 Professional growth; B9 Skill development.</p> <p>A4 Teacher image: B10 Academic style; B11 Professional ethics and conduct; B12 Teacher-student relationship.</p>
6	Studies on the evaluation index system of curriculum-based ideological and political education in local Universities [12]	<p>A1 Target positioning: B1 Curriculum goals; B2 Teaching objectives.</p> <p>A2 Curriculum resources: B3 Curriculum textbooks; B4 Teaching resources.</p> <p>A3 Teaching implementation: B5 Teaching design; B6 Teaching arrangement; B7 Teaching content; B8 Teaching methods; B9 Teaching assessment.</p> <p>A4 Teaching effect: B10 Learning behaviors; B11 Learning outcomes; B12 Teaching effectiveness.</p> <p>A5 Teaching research: B13 Teaching reflection; B14 Teaching discussion; B15 Teaching reform.</p>
7	Analysis on the construction of curriculum ideology and politics teaching evaluation system in colleges and universities [13]	<p>A1 Departmental curriculum ideological and political education construction level: B1 Deployment documents for curriculum ideological and political education; B2 Goals for curriculum ideological and political education construction; B3 Proportion of curriculum ideological and political education courses offered.</p> <p>A2 Teachers' curriculum ideological and political education competence: B4 Ability to grasp students' political and ideological states; B5 Curriculum and textbook construction competence; B6 Curriculum ideological and political education teaching competence; B7 Curriculum ideological and political education evaluation competence; B8 Reflection and innovation competence.</p> <p>A3 Evaluation indicators for curriculum ideological and political education in classrooms: B9 Exploration of ideological and political elements in professional courses; B10 Integration of ideological and political elements with professional courses; B11 Classroom teaching effectiveness.</p> <p>A4 Evaluation indicators for students' political ideology and values: B12 Course assessment; B13 Satisfaction with curriculum ideological and political education.</p>

Table 1. A Review of the Evaluation Indicators of the Literature Closely Related to This Subject (3)

Numble	Literature	Evaluation Indicator
8	Research on the construction of quality evaluation system for ideological and political education in college courses based on effective teaching theory [14]	<p>A1 Teaching objectives: B1 Be able to set clear ideological and political education goals in line with the course content and characteristics and incorporate them into the course standards; B2 The ideological and political education goals can be quantified to a certain extent, and be measurable and evaluable; B3 Students have a clear understanding and recognition of the ideological and political education goals of the course.</p> <p>A2 Teaching content: B4 Accurately and scientifically extract the ideological and political education content of the course; B5 The ideological and political education content is detailedly explained in the course teaching content and reflected in the course standards; B6 The ideological and political education content reflects the knowledge and ability requirements and is conducive to achieving the core goals of the course.</p> <p>A3 Teaching methods: B7 Adopt multiple teaching models and flexible and diverse teaching methods for teaching; B8 Be able to use modern information technology means for teaching; B9 Be able to comprehensively utilize the first and second classrooms for teaching to broaden the channels of ideological and political education in the course.</p> <p>A4 Learning outcomes: B10 The achievement rate of ideological and political education teaching goals is relatively high; B11 The satisfaction rate of students with the ideological and political education teaching activities carried out by teachers is relatively high; B12 Students have a pleasant learning experience and a strong sense of gain in the ideological and political education teaching activities carried out by teachers.</p>
9	The construction and implementing focus of the whole space-time evaluation system for curriculum ideological and political education [15]	<p>A1 Curriculum design: B1 Ideological and political education design; B2 Value guidance; B3 Quality cultivation.</p> <p>A2 Teaching methods: B4 Implicit ideological and political education; B5 Teacher-student interaction; B6 Mutual learning between teachers and students.</p> <p>A3 Curriculum outcomes: B7 International perspective; B8 Patriotic sentiment; B9 Humanistic literacy.</p>
10	Construction of an evaluation system for the ideological and political education effect of vocational education curriculum based on the theory of authenticity evaluation [16]	<p>A1 Evaluation objective: B1 Cultivate students with a national spirit centered on patriotism and a contemporary spirit centered on reform and innovation; B2 Have ideological and political goals with professional characteristics.</p> <p>A2 Authentic task: B3 Real physical environment: real projects from enterprises or virtual simulation training projects; B4 Real social environment: with genuine emotional involvement.</p> <p>A3 Evaluation criteria: B5 Reflect the vocational skills requirements of real positions; B6 Reflect the guiding role for students' values; B7 Co-developed by both the evaluator and the evaluated.</p> <p>A4 Evaluation rubric: B8 Scoring criteria; B9 Quality level descriptions; B10 Quantitative evaluation scores.</p> <p>A5 Evaluation feedback: B11 Process feedback; B12 Comprehensive feedback.</p>

3.2. Extracting Evaluation Indicators from Qualitative Interviews

In the educational ecosystem, teachers play the role of leaders, responsible for planning and guiding the progress of educational and teaching activities; students, on the other hand, are the core subjects in this process, and their learning experiences and growth directly reflect the effectiveness of education. Moreover, enterprises, as an important part of social practice, not only serve as the validators of educational outcomes but also are key forces in shaping the specifications of future talents. Given that these three parties have the most direct and profound understanding of classroom teaching, their voices are particularly important when evaluating educational quality.

To construct a reasonable and operational evaluation index system for ideological and political education in college courses, in-depth interviews with teachers, students and enterprise personnel are indispensable. Through this approach, we can comprehensively and meticulously grasp the actual operation of ideological and political education in courses, including the effectiveness of teaching methods, the improvement of students' ideological and moral qualities, and the alignment of educational outcomes with social demands. Such an interview process not only ensures the scientific nature of the evaluation index system but also enhances its pertinence and practicality, providing solid data support and feedback mechanisms for the continuous optimization of ideological and political education in courses.

3.2.1. Interviewee

Ten senior teachers from five different schools were invited as interviewees. These teachers are all from the front line of teaching, with over ten years of teaching experience, including lecturers, associate professors and professors. Their educational backgrounds cover master's and doctoral degrees. Most importantly, these teachers actively implement the concept of ideological and political education in their daily classroom teaching and have unique and profound insights into how to effectively implement and evaluate ideological and political education in courses. The information of the interviewed teachers is shown in Table 2.

Table 2. List of Information of Interviewed Teachers

Name	Gender	Title	Education	Teaching Experience	Institution
Teacher 1	Male	Lecturer	Doctoral degree	11	Harbin University of Science and Technology (Wei Hai)
Teacher 2	Male	Lecturer	Master's degree	14	Harbin University of Science and Technology (Wei Hai)
Teacher 3	Male	Associate professor	Doctoral degree	14	Shandong Jiaotong University
Teacher 4	Male	Associate professor	Master's degree	11	Shandong Jiaotong University
Teacher 5	Female	Lecturer	Master's degree	11	Weihai Vocational College
Teacher 6	Male	Lecturer	Master's degree	11	Weihai Vocational College
Teacher 7	Female	Lecturer	Master's degree	10	Shandong Drug and Food Vocational College
Teacher 8	Female	Professor	Master's degree	15	Weihai Ocean Vocational College
Teacher 9	Female	Associate professor	Master's degree	11	Weihai Ocean Vocational College
Teacher 10	Female	Associate professor	Master's degree	11	Weihai Ocean Vocational College

We also invited twenty-five students to participate in the interviews. All of them have been influenced by ideological and political education in the curriculum. Among them, fifteen are current students who can directly reflect the implementation effect of ideological and political education in the curriculum at present; the other ten are alumni who graduated three years ago. Their perspectives provide valuable references for the long-term impact of ideological and political education in the curriculum. The information of the interviewed students is shown in Table 3.

Table 3. List of Information of Interviewed Students

Name	Gender	Major	Remark
Student 1	Male	Animal Pharmacy	Current Student
Student 2	Female	Animal Pharmacy	Current Student
Student 3	Female	Big Data and Accounting	Current Student
Student 4	Male	Internet of Things Application Technology	Current Student
Student 5	Male	Internet of Things Application Technology	Current Student
Student 6	Male	Aquaculture Technology	Current Student
Student 7	Male	Aquaculture Technology	Current Student
Student 8	Female	Intelligent Monitoring and Governance of Water Environment	Current Student
Student 9	Male	Ship Engineering Technology	Current Student
Student 10	Male	Ship Electronic and Electrical Technology	Current Student
Student 11	Male	Mechatronics	Current Student
Student 12	Male	Mechatronics	Current Student
Student 13	Female	Aquatic Animal Medicine	Current Student
Student 14	Female	Aquatic Animal Medicine	Current Student
Student 15	Female	Pharmaceutical Biotechnology	Current Student
Student 16	Male	Aquaculture Technology	Graduate
Student 17	Male	Aquaculture Technology	Graduate
Student 18	Male	Aquaculture Technology	Graduate
Student 19	Female	Feed and Animal Nutrition	Graduate
Student 20	Male	Feed and Animal Nutrition	Graduate
Student 21	Male	Feed and Animal Nutrition	Graduate
Student 22	Female	Pharmaceutical Biotechnology	Graduate
Student 23	Male	Pharmaceutical Biotechnology	Graduate
Student 24	Female	Food and Drug Administration Supervision and Management	Graduate
Student 25	Male	Food and Drug Administration Supervision and Management	Graduate

We also specially invited representatives from ten enterprises that have close school-enterprise cooperation with our school. These enterprises have not only jointly formulated course standards with us and participated in the planning of talent cultivation programs, but also deeply understood the importance of integrating ideological and political education into courses for cultivating the qualities of talents needed by enterprises in practice. Their participation will provide a unique industry perspective for us to comprehensively evaluate the social value and practical application effect of integrating ideological and political education into courses. The information of the interviewed enterprises is shown in Table 4.

Table 4. List of Information of Interviewed Students

Number	Enterprise Name
1	Guangzhou XXX Aquatic Products Technology Co., Ltd.
2	Beijing XXX Technology Co., Ltd.
3	Shandong XXX Bioengineering Co., Ltd.
4	Jiangsu XXX Co., Ltd.
5	Yantai XXX Fishery Co., Ltd.
6	Qingdao XXX Co., Ltd.
7	Tianjin XXX Biotechnology Co., Ltd.
8	Yangzhou XXX Biotechnology Co., Ltd.
9	Shandong XXX Pharmaceutical Co., Ltd.
10	Huai'an XXX Co., Ltd.

3.2.2. Interview Outline

After thoroughly studying relevant literature and referring to the guiding documents on ideological and political education in courses, and in light of the clear objectives and core content of this research, we carefully designed three categories of core questions for different types of interviewees, as shown in Table 5.

Table 5. Qualitative Interview Outline

Interviewee	Interview Outline
Teacher	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ① In your opinion, which factors have influenced the effectiveness of ideological and political education in courses? ② During the process of ideological and political education in courses, what do you think we should pay attention to? ③ In the long term, which indicators do you think reflect the effectiveness of ideological and political education in courses?
Student	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ① What have you gained through ideological and political education in courses? ② How are the courses you study assessed and evaluated? Do you know the corresponding evaluation criteria? Do you have any suggestions? ③ During the implementation of ideological and political education in courses, what contents or matters do you most hope the teachers will pay attention to?
Enterprise	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ① What do you think are the most essential qualities or attributes that students need when entering the workforce? ② During the implementation of ideological and political education in courses, what aspects or matters do you most hope teachers will pay attention to? ③ In the long run, which indicators do you think are the key factors for employees' career development?

3.2.3. Interview Implementation

Given the current objective constraints, we have decided to adopt flexible methods such as online video calls, phone interviews, and face-to-face interviews to ensure the smooth progress of the interviews. At the beginning of each interview, we will clearly explain the purpose and objective of the interview to ensure that each interviewee has a clear understanding of the content. After obtaining their explicit consent, we will activate the recording device to document the entire interview process. Subsequently, we will strictly follow the prepared interview outline to guide the interview in depth, while paying attention to controlling the pace

of the interview to ensure that the entire process is completed efficiently within approximately 30 minutes.

3.2.4. Analysis of Interview Results

The interview audio was transcribed into text within 24 hours after the interview. The Colaizzi phenomenological data analysis method was adopted to organize and analyze the data, aiming to extract key information and core points from it [17]. The summary and analysis of the qualitative interview results are presented in Table 6.

Table 6. Summary and Analysis of Qualitative Interview Results (1)

Name	Meaningful Statements Made by the Interviewee	Element Extraction
Teacher 1	"Our ideological and political education in courses is closely aligned with the demands of the country, the school, and enterprises, and it should play a promoting role in work. Otherwise, there is no need to invest so much time and energy in it." "Teaching conditions are the foundation of educational quality. During the implementation of ideological and political education in courses, we should make more use of information technology. For instance, in the practical skills training stage, if students can operate in a high-fidelity, enterprise-like training room, then the sense of safety responsibility will be imperceptibly instilled."	Teaching facilities, teaching methods, needs analysis
Teacher 2	"The ideological and political quality of teachers themselves directly determines the quality of ideological and political education in courses. If teachers do not have a deep and accurate understanding of ideological and political theories, they will find it difficult to accurately integrate ideological and political elements into their courses, and may even lead students astray. For instance, when interpreting certain national policies or social phenomena, if teachers themselves have only a superficial understanding, they will be unable to clearly convey the ideological and political values contained therein to students." "Pay attention to social hot issues, industry development trends, and topics of concern to students, and incorporate these contents into teaching to make ideological and political education more contemporary and appealing."	Teachers' ideological and political literacy, ideological and political resources
Teacher 3	"If teachers merely rigidly explain ideological and political theories in class without integrating practical cases or applying interactive teaching methods, it will lead to students' lack of interest in ideological and political content and fail to achieve the expected educational outcomes." "The ideological and political education in courses for students is not the responsibility of a single teacher; it requires the joint efforts of all teachers and a well-designed top-level plan. The communication and cooperation among teachers can facilitate the sharing of teaching experiences and jointly enhance the teaching level of ideological and political courses."	Teaching methods, teaching implementation, systematicness of ideological and political education in courses, and the teaching staff
Teacher 4	"If ideological and political elements are disconnected from the content of professional courses and merely 'tagged' on, students will perceive ideological and political education as an additional burden and fail to truly understand its intrinsic connection with professional knowledge. Only by naturally integrating ideological and political elements into the teaching content of professional courses can students receive ideological and political education imperceptibly while learning professional knowledge." "The teaching philosophy of teachers, their understanding of ideological and political education in courses, and the teaching methods they adopt will all directly affect the effectiveness of ideological and political education in courses."	The ideological and political content reflects the professional characteristics, teaching methods, and the faculty team.

Table 6. Summary and Analysis of Qualitative Interview Results (2)

Name	Meaningful Statements Made by the Interviewee	Element Extraction
Teacher 5	"During class, interaction between teachers and students is the key to enhancing the effectiveness of ideological and political education in courses. If teachers lack interaction and communication with students in the classroom and merely unilaterally impart knowledge, students will be unable to participate in the ideological and political education process and find it difficult to form their own thoughts and opinions. Through effective interaction, teachers can understand students' ideological trends and confusions, promptly adjust teaching strategies, and enhance the pertinence of ideological and political education."	Teaching methods, teaching implementation
Teacher 6	"Course-based ideological and political education does not merely achieve excellent educational outcomes through a single course or a single teacher, and such educational outcomes are not immediately apparent. It is possible that students will benefit from it at some point in the future." "The realization of good educational outcomes in course-based ideological and political education requires teachers to constantly improve their ideological and political capabilities and teaching skills." "Whether the content of course-based ideological and political education is close to real life and can evoke students' resonance and reflection is an important factor influencing its effectiveness."	The systematic and long-term nature of ideological and political education evaluation in courses, the teaching staff, and the content of ideological and political education.
Teacher 7	"Our educational subjects are students. Each student has different learning foundations, interests, ideas and values. Therefore, a certain ideological and political element may be applicable to some students but not to others. Thus, we should teach students in accordance with their aptitudes, which also poses more challenging questions for teachers, that is, how to effectively organize classroom teaching." "Adopting diverse teaching methods, such as case analysis, group discussion and role-playing, can enhance students' sense of participation and interest, thereby improving the effectiveness of ideological and political education in the course."	Teaching implementation, teaching methods
Teacher 8	"The effectiveness of ideological and political education in courses depends on the collaborative efforts of society, schools, and families. The synergy between family education and school education is also a crucial factor influencing the outcome of ideological and political education in courses. Parents' attitudes and values have a profound impact on students' ideological education. Therefore, teachers need to maintain communication with parents to jointly promote the all-round development of students." "The effectiveness of ideological and political education in courses largely depends on whether the integration of course content and ideological and political education elements is natural and appropriate. If ideological and political elements can be skillfully integrated into professional knowledge, they will be more easily accepted and understood by students."	Systematic ideological and political education in courses and teaching implementation

Table 6. Summary and Analysis of Qualitative Interview Results (3)

Name	Meaningful Statements Made by the Interviewee	Element Extraction
Teacher 9	"The richness and diversity of course resources can provide more materials and cases for ideological and political education, thereby enhancing the vividness and persuasiveness of teaching." "The students' participation and interest in the course are the key factors influencing the effect of ideological and political education in the course. If students are interested in the course content and actively participate in discussions and thinking, the effect of ideological and political education will be more significant."	Teaching resources, teaching methods, and students' satisfaction with teaching
Teacher 10	"A good classroom atmosphere and harmonious teacher-student relationship can help promote students' thinking and communication, thereby enhancing the effectiveness of ideological and political education in courses." "The school's policy support, resource allocation and training efforts for ideological and political education in courses will all affect teachers' teaching enthusiasm and the implementation effect of ideological and political education in courses." "Changes in the social environment and the background of the times will have an impact on students' ideological concepts and value orientations, thereby affecting the effectiveness of ideological and political education in courses."	Teacher-student interaction and communication, students' classroom participation, policy support, teaching methods, and teaching implementation.
Student 1	"Good academic performance does not necessarily make a good student. Teachers need to change this mindset." "The evaluation of ideological and political education in courses cannot be judged merely by testing knowledge. It should be a comprehensive assessment, such as performance in social practice and internships at enterprises."	Students' satisfaction with the ideological and political education in courses and their social contributions
Student 2	"Sometimes the content of ideological and political education in courses is rather theoretical and not closely related to our professional studies and real life."	Teaching content
Student 3	"Each of us students has a different learning ability and level of knowledge mastery. However, in class, teachers often teach at a uniform pace and assign the same homework."	Teaching according to students' aptitude
Student 4	"Every student has a different way and pace of learning, but some teachers apply a uniform standard to all. For instance, some students may need more time to understand a certain knowledge point, but the teacher might think they are not working hard enough, which makes us feel a bit unfair." "I hope that in ideological and political theory classes, there can be more interaction and a sense of participation, rather than the teacher just lecturing all the time."	Teaching according to students' aptitude, teaching methods, teaching implementation
Student 5	"The current ideological and political education in courses is sometimes rather dull. It mainly involves teachers lecturing and students listening, with weak interaction. If more vivid methods, such as videos, group discussions, and practical activities, could be adopted, it might make us more interested and help us remember the principles more easily."	Teaching methods, teaching implementation

Table 6. Summary and Analysis of Qualitative Interview Results (4)

Name	Meaningful Statements Made by the Interviewee	Element Extraction
Student 6	"In addition to expounding on grand principles, ideological and political education in courses should also pay attention to our actual concerns and needs. For instance, it could delve more into practical issues such as how to deal with workplace stress and how to handle interpersonal relationships. This would make us feel that ideological and political education is more useful."	Ideological and political content
Student 7	"In ideological and political education within courses, teachers can interact more with us, listen to our thoughts and opinions, rather than just unidirectionally imparting knowledge. For instance, they can adopt methods such as discussions and debates to involve us in the class and allow us to express our viewpoints."	Teaching methods, teaching implementation
Student 8	"Sometimes teachers tend to pay more attention to students with good grades or outstanding performance, while those with average grades or introverted personalities are easily overlooked. In fact, every student hopes to receive the teacher's attention and encouragement, especially those who are less confident, who may need the teacher's care even more."	Student satisfaction with teaching
Student 9	"The current evaluation of ideological and political education in courses mainly relies on examinations or writing papers. This approach may not truly reflect our understanding and acceptance of ideological and political content. If some practical assessment elements could be incorporated, such as participation in social public welfare activities or performance in professional practice, the evaluation might be more comprehensive."	Student satisfaction with teaching and social contribution
Student 10	"I hope that teachers can incorporate more real industry cases and outstanding role models when explaining ideological and political content. For instance, by sharing the growth stories of some excellent craftsmen, entrepreneurs or technical experts within the industry, we can be inspired to establish a correct career outlook and values. This not only makes the lessons lively and interesting but also enables us to feel the practicality of ideological and political content."	Ideological and political resources
Student 11	"Each student has different interests, personalities and career plans. However, when teachers teach ideological and political content, they often treat everyone in the same way. For instance, some students are more interested in technology, while others prefer art or management. If the teaching could be tailored to our interests, it might make us more engaged."	Teaching according to students' aptitude
Student 12	"Some teachers seldom communicate with students in daily life. Besides academic issues, they rarely care about our lives and mental states. In fact, we also have many troubles and pressures. If we could talk more with our teachers, we might feel more relaxed."	Teacher-student interaction and communication, students' satisfaction with teaching
Student 13	"Every student has different interests, strengths and career plans. Therefore, I hope that teachers can pay attention to our individualized needs. For instance, when teaching ideological and political content, they can combine the characteristics of different majors or provide differentiated guidance based on our interests and career goals. This will make us feel that ideological and political education in courses is more closely related to our actual needs."	Teaching implementation

Table 6. Summary and Analysis of Qualitative Interview Results (5)

Name	Meaningful Statements Made by the Interviewee	Element Extraction
Student 14	"We hope that teachers can closely integrate the content of ideological and political education with our professional courses, enabling us to deeply understand the significance of professional ethics, social responsibility and the spirit of craftsmanship while learning professional skills. Through specific cases and practical activities, we can feel the charm of the mutual reinforcement between professional skills and ideological and political qualities."	Teaching content, ideological and political resources
Student 15	"I feel there is a certain distance between my teacher and me. Every time a question is raised in class, the teacher always habitually calls on those students who have good grades and are active to answer. For students like me who are rather introverted and have average grades, even if we have ideas in our minds, we seldom have the chance to express them. During the break, the teacher always leaves the classroom in a hurry and rarely has time to chat with us and understand the problems we encounter in our studies and lives."	Student satisfaction with teaching and interaction and communication between teachers and students
Student 16	"I think when teachers evaluate us, they could invite enterprise teachers to participate in the ideological and political assessment of the course. Enterprise teachers can evaluate our ideological and political performance and professional qualities during internships and practical training from the perspective of actual work scenarios and professional demands."	Participation of off-campus part-time teachers
Student 17	"When the teacher is lecturing on ideological and political content, sometimes they mention some role models or cases, but these examples might be far from our lives or not described vividly enough. If they could talk more about industry role models we are familiar with or outstanding people around us, it might make us feel more resonant."	Teaching implementation, ideological and political content
Student 18	"Sometimes, after we hand in our homework or take an exam, it takes a long time for the teacher to give feedback. By the time the feedback comes, we have already forgotten where the problems were. If we could get feedback in a timely manner, we could improve more quickly. This might seem a bit distant from our lives or not vivid enough. If more examples of role models in industries we are familiar with or outstanding people around us were given, it might resonate with us more."	Feedback regulation
Student 19	"I hope that ideological and political education in courses is not just theoretical explanations, but also includes more practical and experiential teaching. For instance, organizing us to participate in social public welfare activities, enterprise visits, and career experiences, allowing us to feel the significance and value of ideological and political content in practice. This not only deepens our understanding but also makes us more actively involved. We have already forgotten where the problems were at that time. If we could receive feedback in a timely manner, we could improve more quickly. Sometimes the content can seem distant from our lives or not vividly presented. If more industry role models we are familiar with or outstanding individuals around us could be introduced, it might resonate with us more."	Teaching implementation, teaching content

Table 6. Summary and Analysis of Qualitative Interview Results (6)

Name	Meaningful Statements Made by the Interviewee	Element Extraction
Student 20	"Sometimes, the content of ideological and political courses seems a bit distant from our lives. For instance, they often discuss some macro social issues. However, what we are more concerned about are practical problems such as how to deal with study pressure, how to handle interpersonal relationships, and how to plan our career development. If the courses could pay more attention to our actual needs, it might make us feel that they are more useful."	Ideological and political content, communication between teachers and students, students' needs
Student 21	"I hope that teachers can pay attention to our career planning and goals for the future, and help us understand the corresponding career fields and development directions of our major. For instance, teachers can invite outstanding individuals from the industry to give lectures and share their career development paths, allowing us to have a more intuitive understanding of the possibilities of career development and thus determine our own career goals."	Participation of off-campus teachers
Student 22	"Nowadays, artificial intelligence is developing so rapidly that we can directly ask AI for knowledge-based information. However, I believe that the cultivation of good qualities and stable emotions cannot be fully achieved with the help of AI. Therefore, I hope that teachers can pay more attention to our emotional needs, provide necessary psychological support and counseling, and help us build a positive mindset and the ability to cope with pressure."	Ideological and political content, communication between teachers and students, students' needs
Student 23	"Nowadays, teachers' evaluations of us mainly focus on the teaching process of each course. Once a course is over, does that mean our qualities have improved? Besides, we cannot simply assess the impact of ideological and political education in courses based on short-term performances such as exam results."	Effect evaluation
Student 24	"Nowadays, teachers tend to evaluate students through classroom performance, exams and other means. In fact, students can evaluate each other. In group projects, team assignments and other activities, we can assess each other's teamwork ability, communication skills, dedication and other ideological and political-related performances."	Effect evaluation
Student 25	"Sometimes the ideological and political content taught by teachers is rather abstract. For instance, they talk about many grand principles, but we would prefer to hear some concrete examples related to our career development and daily life. If it could be more closely linked to our major and future career, it might make it easier for us to understand and accept."	Ideological and political content
Enterprise 1	"Students should first and foremost develop a strong sense of professional mission, be courageous to confront and overcome all kinds of difficult conditions they may encounter at work, and not be afraid of dirt or hard work." "It is necessary to cultivate students' self-discipline and self-supervision abilities. Even when no one is supervising, they should still adhere to professional ethics and norms, maintain a high sense of responsibility, and be consistent in their behavior both in public and in private."	Professional spirit
Enterprise 2	"Students need to have a solid foundation of professional knowledge and the skills to apply that knowledge in practical work. This is the basic prerequisite for completing tasks and creating value for enterprises." "I hope teachers can elaborate on the importance of professional ethics, including qualities such as integrity, responsibility, and dedication. At the same time, emphasize the cultivation of professional qualities, such as time management, teamwork, and effective communication, which are all indispensable abilities in the workplace."	Theoretical knowledge, practical skills, professional spirit

Table 6. Summary and Analysis of Qualitative Interview Results (7)

Name	Meaningful Statements Made by the Interviewee	Element Extraction
Enterprise 3	"Be serious and responsible in your work, and fulfill your duties." "In the workplace, it is crucial to abide by laws and regulations as well as the rules and regulations of the enterprise. I hope the teacher can incorporate relevant legal and regulatory content into the course to enhance students' awareness of compliance and help them understand and follow workplace rules."	Ideological and political content, professional spirit
Enterprise 4	"Innovative thinking and critical thinking are important capabilities that enterprises need. I hope teachers can inspire students' creativity and encourage them to come up with new ideas and methods. At the same time, cultivate their critical thinking so that they can think independently and analyze problems." "One must have the spirit of hard work and endurance. Additionally, one should handle the affairs of the enterprise as if they were their own family's business."	Professional spirit
Enterprise 5	"The workplace is changing rapidly, with new technologies and tools emerging constantly. Students need to maintain a continuous learning attitude, constantly improve themselves, and at the same time have good adaptability, being able to quickly integrate into new working environments and teams."	Professional spirit
Enterprise 6	"Setbacks and difficulties are inevitable in work. Students need to maintain a positive attitude and be brave enough to face challenges. At the same time, they should have a certain ability to withstand pressure, be able to remain calm under pressure and deal with it effectively."	Professional spirit
Enterprise 7	"At some critical stages of projects, employees need to work continuously and endure hardships. Those who are hardworking and willing to endure will step forward voluntarily and take on key tasks." "Students need to remain honest and trustworthy and abide by professional ethics."	Professional spirit
Enterprise 8	"Stress and challenges in the workplace are inevitable. I hope teachers can pay attention to students' mental health, teach them methods to deal with stress, such as time management and emotion regulation. At the same time, guide students to develop a positive mindset and remain optimistic and confident when facing challenges." "One must have a sense of responsibility."	Ideological and political content, professional spirit
Enterprise 9	"By integrating real-life corporate cases and workplace experience into the teaching, students can understand the course content more intuitively and apply it to their actual work. It is hoped that the teacher can invite professionals from enterprises to give lectures or hold sharing sessions, allowing students to gain more insights into the workplace and practical experience."	Teaching implementation, participation of off-campus teachers
Enterprise 10	"Effective communication in the workplace can enhance work efficiency and prevent misunderstandings and conflicts. Teachers can organize classroom discussions, group projects, role-playing activities, etc., to train students' expression ability, listening skills and communication techniques, enabling them to express their ideas clearly, understand others' viewpoints, and communicate and collaborate effectively with people of different personalities and backgrounds. I hope teachers can invite business professionals to give lectures or share their experiences, so that students can learn more about the workplace and gain practical experience."	Teaching methods, teaching implementation

4. Establishment of Evaluation Indicators for Ideological and Political Education in Courses

Based on the above literature analysis and qualitative interview analysis, combined with relevant policy documents, and based on the four core dimensions of the CIPP evaluation theory - background evaluation, input evaluation, process evaluation, and outcome evaluation, we have divided the ideological and political education evaluation project of higher vocational professional courses into four closely connected links (i.e., first-level indicators) in accordance with the phased characteristics of educational activities: goal demand, implementation strategy, execution and implementation, and effect evaluation. In addition, in order to further refine the effect evaluation link, we have also drawn on the four-level evaluation activities of the Kirkpatrick model and refined the effect evaluation into four second-level indicators: reaction level, learning level, behavior level, and result level. Adhering to the principles of objectivity, operability, development, professionalism, and process, we have initially formulated the indicators of the ideological and political education evaluation system for courses, as shown in Table 7.

Table 7. Evaluation Indicators for Ideological and Political Education in Courses (1)

Primary Indicator	Secondary Indicator	Tertiary Indicator	Indicator Connotation
A1 Target requirements	B1 Ideological and political goals of the course	C1 The goals reflect the professional characteristics and are systematic and targeted.	Based on the ideological and political education goals of professional courses, set appropriate and professionally distinctive ideological and political education goals for the courses. According to the ideological and political education goals of the courses, set ideological and political education goals for each unit. The ideological and political education goals at all levels, from the professional level to the semester, course, and unit, should be interconnected and integrated. These goals should be included in the course standards.
		C2 The goals are feasible, assessable, and measurable.	The goals of ideological and political education in courses should be feasible, assessable and measurable.
		C3 Students are familiar with the goals.	Students have a clear understanding and knowledge of the ideological and political education goals of the courses.
	B2 Demand analysis	C5 Student demands	In light of the actual learning situation, promote the progressive improvement of students' ideological and political literacy.
		C5 School demands	In line with the school's educational orientation and school culture
		C6 Job demands	Be in line with the professional qualities required for the corresponding industry positions in professional services.

Table 7. Evaluation Indicators for Ideological and Political Education in Courses (2)

Primary Indicator	Secondary Indicator	Tertiary Indicator	Indicator Connotation
A2 Implementation strategy	B3 Hardware facilities	C7 Teaching facilities	A data platform for ideological and political education in courses shared by teachers and students, supporting facilities (online teaching platforms, offline teaching facilities), interactive venues (teaching and research salons, discussion rooms, virtual simulations, campus cultural activity venues), etc.
		C8 Policy support	Introduce relevant policy documents for support, including rewards and recognition, financial support, etc.
	B4 Teaching staff	C9 Teachers' ideological and political quality	The performance of teachers in terms of ideological and political theory level, political morality, and professional ethics.
		C10 Teachers' recognition of the ideological and political education in curriculum	Teachers have a conscious awareness of integrating ideological and political education into courses, and accept and recognize the concept of incorporating ideological and political education into course teaching.
		C11 Teaching team's research and teaching ability	The teaching team regularly organizes teaching and research activities to share and exchange teaching experiences. The teaching team possesses both teaching and research capabilities.
		C12 Professional title and educational background structure	The professional titles and educational qualifications of the teaching team.
	B5 Teaching resources	C13 Course-based ideological and political elements database	The teaching cases and video resources of ideological and political education in courses are abundant, vivid and updated in a timely manner.
		C14 Teaching text materials	The teaching plan reflects the design of ideological and political education in the curriculum; the courseware includes ideological and political content; the teaching materials selected are the latest national planning textbooks, and the content of the teaching materials is scientific, reflecting the latest technological progress in the industry and enterprises, and meeting the requirements of ideological and political education in the curriculum.
	B6 Teaching content	C15 General ideological and political education content	Education on Thought of Socialism with Chinese Characteristics for a New Era, socialist core values, fine traditional Chinese culture, and education on the "Four Histories", professional ethics, etc.
		C16 Professional characteristic ideological and political education content	In teaching, the introduction of real projects from enterprises can make the abstract ideological and political education concrete and tangible through practical work tasks.
	B7 Teaching methods	C17 Integration of information technology	Adopting a blended teaching approach of online and offline, and leveraging information technology to facilitate ideological and political education in courses.
		C18 Flexible methods	According to the type and characteristics of the courses, flexible and appropriate teaching methods should be selected, including: project-based teaching method, task-driven method, action-oriented teaching method, heuristic method, case method, cooperative learning method, problem-based teaching method, demonstration method, etc.

Table 7. Evaluation Indicators for Ideological and Political Education in Courses (3)

Primary Indicator	Secondary Indicator	Tertiary Indicator	Indicator Connotation
A3 Execution and implementation	B8 Quality monitoring	C19 Student classroom participation	The enthusiasm, initiative and level of engagement of students in the classroom.
		C20 Student attendance rate	Student attendance situation
		C21 Classroom discipline	Students' performance in time management, classroom behavior norms, classroom order, and examination discipline, etc.
		C22 Post-class assessment	The assessment focuses on the process, value-added, formative aspects, and involves multiple assessment subjects and diverse forms. It also reflects the examination of students' professional qualities and moral habits.
		C23 In-school full-time teachers' classroom satisfaction	In the process of classroom teaching, teachers achieve their teaching goals, promote students' growth and development, and gain recognition and appreciation from students, colleagues, or the school and other aspects, thus generating positive and pleasant psychological experiences.
		C24 Off-school part-time teachers' participation	Enterprise or industry personnel participate in the implementation and evaluation of courses.
	B9 Implementation process	C25 Teaching task implementation	In accordance with the teaching design, the teacher successfully completed the teaching tasks and achieved the teaching goals.
		C26 Natural integration of ideological and political education	The integration of teaching content and ideological and political education elements is natural and appropriate.
		C27 Teaching according to students' aptitude	Based on students' learning foundation, interests, ideas and values, organize classroom teaching effectively and teach students in accordance with their aptitudes.
		C28 Interactive communication	Carry out multi-level and systematic interactive communication to promptly grasp and accurately understand the students' ideological, emotional and psychological dynamic changes.
		C29 Feedback and adjustment	Based on students' academic performance and classroom behavior, promptly adjust the implementation strategies of ideological and political education in the curriculum.

Table 7. Evaluation Indicators for Ideological and Political Education in Courses (4)

Primary Indicator	Secondary Indicator	Tertiary Indicator	Indicator Connotation
A4 Effect evaluation	B10 Reaction layer	C30 Students' satisfaction with teaching	By collecting feedback from the educated, such as through questionnaires, group discussions or face-to-face interviews, one can understand their overall feelings towards educational activities, as well as their satisfaction with the teaching content, teaching methods and educators.
	B11 Learning layer	C31 Theoretical knowledge	Students' mastery of knowledge
		C32 Practical skills	Students' mastery of skills
	B12 Behavior layer	C33 Behavioral change	By means of observation, peer evaluation, feedback from superiors, self-assessment or performance indicators, etc., comprehensively review the students' performance in daily life, social interaction and enterprise internship practice, to determine whether they can naturally apply the theoretical knowledge and practical skills learned in ideological and political courses.
		C34 Attitude and emotion	The sense of autonomy in learning and professional honor have been enhanced.
	B13 Result layer	C35 Social contribution	Whether students' sense of social responsibility has been enhanced and whether their participation in public welfare activities has increased, etc.
		C36 Career development	Investigate the satisfaction of employers with students' professional qualities, students' income, and students' employment competitiveness, etc.

5. Conclusion

This article constructs the evaluation indicators of ideological and political education in courses from four dimensions: target requirements, implementation strategies, execution and implementation, and effect evaluation. These four aspects are not isolated evaluation links but an organic whole that is interrelated and progressive. Target requirements indicate the value orientation and educational direction of ideological and political education in courses and serve as the logical starting point of the evaluation. Implementation strategies determine the integration path of teaching content and methods and act as a bridge connecting the goals with practice. Execution and implementation focus on the specific implementation inside and outside the classroom and are the key to whether the strategies can be transformed into practical results. Effect evaluation, through multi-dimensional feedback, examines and calibrates the scientificity and effectiveness of the first three aspects.

However, we should also be clearly aware that the construction of evaluation indicators is not an overnight task. Ideological and political education in courses itself is a dynamic and developing practical process, and its evaluation indicators need to be continuously iterated and optimized along with the deepening of educational reform and the upgrading of educational requirements. Future research should further focus on the scientific distribution of indicator weights, the deep integration of qualitative and quantitative evaluations, and the tracking of teaching effects based on big data.

Acknowledgements

The author(s) declare that financial support was received for the research and/or publication of this article. This work received financial support from the General Research Project on Education and Teaching of Shandong Province under Grant No. 2023JXY272, Shandong Province Education Science "14th Five-Year Plan" Project under Grant No. 2023YB078.

References

- [1] M.M. Wang, X.Y. Xiong: Evaluation and analysis of the implementation effect of ideological and political education based on the improved TOPSIS method ——a case study of Hebei Finance University, *Foreign Economic Relations & Trade*, (2023) No.5, p.109-114+119.
- [2] J. Bao: Research on the ideological and political teaching evaluation of international economics and trade courses based on the CIPP model, *Journal of Social Science of Jiamusi University*, Vol. 44 (2026) No.2, p.181-185.
- [3] J. Gu, J. Ma, Y. Liang: Analysis on the status and influencing factors of ideological & political education teaching evaluation in higher vocational nursing based on the CIPP model, Vol. 44 (2026) No.1, p.39-43.
- [4] S.J. Zhang, L.F. Bai, B.B. Yang: Mixed teaching quality evaluation of organizational behavior course based on CIPP model, *Frontiers in Education*, Vol. 10 (2025).
- [5] T.T. Zhao, L. Yu, X.Y. Jiang, et al. Construction of a public health practice teaching quality evaluation system based on the CIPP model using the Analytic Hierarchy Process (AHP) and entropy weight method, *Bmc Medical Education*, Vol. 25 (2025) No.1, p.368.
- [6] L. Moldovan: Training outcome evaluation model, in 9th International Conference on Interdisciplinarity in Engineering (INTER-ENG) (Tirgu Mures, Romania, October 08-09, 2015). Vol. 22, p.1184-1190.
- [7] Y.L. Sun: Research on the construction of the evaluation index system for ideological and political teaching in college and university curriculum (M.S., Northeast Petroleum University, China 2022), p.24.
- [8] Y. Zhang: Research on curriculum ideological and political evaluation system of higher vocational colleges based on CIPP evaluation (M.S., Southwest University, China 2023), p.32.
- [9] Y.X. Wang: On the construction of the evaluation system for ideological and political education in college courses, *Leading Journal of Ideological & Theoretical Education*, (2020) No.10, p.125-130.
- [10] Y.H. Zheng: Research on the construction of evaluation index system of ideological and political teaching in all colleges course (M.S., Southwest University, China 2021), p.53.
- [11] J. Chen, Y.Xu: Construction of the evaluation index system of all-course-based ideological and political education in higher education courses, *Journal of Wuhan University of Technology (Social Sciences Edition)*, Vol. 37 (2024) No.3, p.124-132.
- [12] Y.B. Gao: Studies on the evaluation index system of curriculum-based ideological and political education in local Universities, *Research and Exploration in Laboratory*, Vol. 41 (2022) No.11, p.242-248.
- [13] Z.M. Zhuang, X. Guan, J.R.Huang, et al. Analysis on the construction of curriculum ideology and politics teaching evaluation system in colleges and universities, *Education and Teaching Forum*, (2023) No.20, p.176-179.

- [14] Y. Li: Research on the construction of quality evaluation system for ideological and political education in college courses based on effective teaching theory, *Social Sciences in Guangxi*, (2023) No.7, p.169-174.
- [15] Y.L. Li, C.L. Liu: The construction and implementing focus of the whole space-time evaluation system for curriculum ideological and political education, *Academic Exploration*, (2024) No.5, p.143-149.
- [16] F. Guo: Construction of an evaluation system for the ideological and political education effect of vocational education curriculum based on the theory of authenticity evaluation, *Vocational and Technical Education*, Vol. 43 (2022) No.11, p.62-68.
- [17] C.T. Wang: Construction of the evaluation index system of standardized training effect for new nurses based on CIPP model and Kirkpatrick model (M.S., Nanjing University, China 2019), p.22.